

[text deleted]

To generate a technically sound approach to the elicitation and analysis of expert judgments about uncertainty in the PM_{2.5} concentration-response function, EPA is considering engaging analysts experienced in expert judgment elicitation. The following tasks outline the process we envision for completion of the pilot.

1. **Defining elicitation scope and focus:** The first step will require that the elicitation analyst work with EPA staff responsible for the benefits analysis to define the specific questions to be answered. [text deleted] The goal of this step will be to make sure that the questions both serve the needs of the benefits assessment and are suitable for posing to experts. The elicitation analyst will also work closely with suitable “domain” experts in defining the approach.
2. **Preparation of elicitation protocol:** The elicitation analyst will assist in the development of a technically sound and feasible elicitation protocol, based on the technical question, consideration of anticipated analysis of the judgments (e.g. distributional form, combination of the judgments), the phase of the project (pilot or longer-term analysis), and schedule.
3. **Identification and Selection of Experts:** The elicitation analyst will guide the process for identifying and selecting a group of experts with relevant expertise to participate in study. The process should be transparent, using clearly defined selection criteria. EPA is considering using the two existing NAS panels that have recently examined the PM mortality literature and its application to PM health impact assessment, effectively building our initial expert selection upon the process employed by NAS. These two NAS panels, the Committee on Estimating the Health-risk-reduction Benefits of Proposed Air Pollution Regulations, and the Committee on Research Priorities for Airborne Particulate Matter, have members with established credentials in the subject matter area, and have already been selected by their peers as experts. In addition, the use of NAS panels as a source for expert elicitation has been documented in peer-reviewed applications of expert elicitation.
4. **Preparation of Briefing “Book”:** During an elicitation, standard materials are often made available to all experts involved in the form of a file or “briefing book”. It may include a review of common pitfalls in giving subjective judgments, calibration exercises, as well as key papers or analyses relevant to the elicitation questions. The elicitation analyst, in collaboration with EPA and contractor staff, will develop a briefing book documenting key information pertinent to expert elicitation and the PM/chronic mortality issue.
5. **Pilot Testing of Protocol:** Prior to conducting elicitations with the selected experts, the elicitation analyst will conduct pilot testing of the protocol with individuals having relevant expertise in the question(s) being elicited. The goal of the pilot testing will be to determine any changes needed to improve the clarity of the questions and/or the feasibility of the

[continue on 9-15 – May 12 original]